DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

+     +         +             +                 + 

ALCOHOLIC BEVERAGE CONTROL BOARD

+     +         +             +                 + 

MEETING
p
IN THE MATTER OF: :
Asefu Alemayehu :Show Cause
Yegna :Hearing
1920 9th Street NW :
License \#74241 :
Retailer CT :
ANC 1B :
p---------------------1/4

December 12, 2012

The Alcoholic Beverage Control
Board met in Alcoholic Beverage Control Hearing Room, Reeves Building, 2000 14th Street, N.W., Washington, D.C., Ruthanne Miller, Chairperson, presiding.
PRESENT

RUTHANNE MILLER, Chairperson
NICK ALBERTI, Member
DONALD BROOKS, Member
MIKE SILVERSTEIN, Member
HERMAN JONES, Member

## ALSO PRESENT

Fernando Rivero
Wendell Robinson

|  |  | Page 2 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S |  |
| 2 | 11:28 a.m. |  |
| 3 | CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay. The |  |
| 4 | last case on the morning calendar is Case No. |  |
| 5 | 11-CMP-00321, Yegna, located at 1920 9th |  |
| 6 | Street NW, License No. 74241, in ANC 1C. |  |
| 7 | MR. RIVERO: Good morning, Board |  |
| 8 | Members, Fernando Rivero for the District of |  |
| 9 | Columbia. |  |
| 10 | CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay. |  |
| 11 | MR. ROBINSON: Good morning, |  |
| 12 | Wendell Robinson on behalf of Yegna. |  |
| 13 | CHAIRPERSON MILLER: I'm sorry. |  |
| 14 | Could you -- I missed your name. |  |
| 15 | MR. ROBINSON: Wendell Robinson. |  |
| 16 | CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Robinson. |  |
| 17 | Okay, Mr. Robinson, good morning. |  |
| 18 | MR. ROBINSON: Good morning. |  |
| 19 | CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay. |  |
| 20 | MS. ALEMAYEHU: Asefu Alemayehu, |  |
| 21 | owner of Yegna. |  |
| 22 | CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Could you |  |
|  | Neal R. Gross \& Co., Inc. 202-234-4433 |  |

also, I'm sorry --
MS. TAFARI: Tabotu Tafari, I'm the translator.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: -- you are the translator, okay.

Take a seat. It's, actually, easier for us to hear when you are closer to the microphone.

What are you -- what's your name, the translator?

MS. TAFARI: T-A-B-O-T-U, Tabotu.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay. What language?

MS. TAFARI: Amharic and English.
Amharic.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Amharic,
okay.
I need to swear you in as an
interpreter. Okay?
Would you raise your right hand, please? Okay.

Do you solemnly affirm that you
will faithfully and accurately interpret the proceedings in this matter from Amharic into English and from English into Amharic, to the best of your ability?

MS. TAFARI: Yes.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay, thank you.

And, the owner is Ms. Alemayehu.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Mr. Rivero?
MR. RIVERO: I have a procedural
matter, if I may, please, Madam Chairman.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay.
MR. ROBINSON: I'm going to request a continuance of this hearing.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: This is a Show Cause hearing. Okay. You are requesting a continuance, why?

MR. ROBINSON: The reason for the continuance is --

MEMBER ALBERTI: Did we have introductions?

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: We did.

MEMBER ALBERTI: Okay.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: He's Mr.
Robinson.
MR. ROBINSON: -- one, I do not believe that within the past two weeks, three weeks, when I spoke with my client, she didn't understand me.

I've been trial for most of last week, and my trial terminated yesterday.

During those times when I was speaking with my client, she indicated she could understand me. Also, I was concerned by the look of bewilderment and thought she misheard.

I had arranged, prior to this
meeting, to have -- I hired an Amharic interpreter, not this interpreter, to come to my office to just prep my client for today's hearing.

I could not make it, but my associate in the office met with my client, and he retained the Amharic interpreter.

When my client -- my client was explained what we had discussed previously, she indicated this is the first time she's ever heard of it. The crucial point, of course, is she was only aware that she could lose her license and not be able to reapply for five years last night. That's what my associate told me.

So, it became pretty clear that she didn't understand me, although I asked my client, I said, are you understanding me? I think I really need to get an interpreter.

She said I don't think you do, I understand you perfectly. But, it's pretty clear she did not.

And so, it was pretty clear to me then that all of the discussions we had she probably didn't understand most of it, because she's not fluent in English.

It was probably a mistake on my part not to follow my first intuition, thinking she understood me.

1

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: All right.
MR. ROBINSON: But, it's pretty
clear she did not.
So, I've advised Counsel of what I intended to do, and I apologize for it being so late. But, I will say this, that but for the meeting last night we probably would have gone forward on the hearing, and probably would have been ill-prepared and not advised of what the consequences were.

So, I'm asking, and I apologize for the lateness of it, however, it's very clear to me that any conversations that I have with my client I'm going to have interpreter there.

The retained Amharic interpreter was supposed to be here this morning. I don't know where she is. She was in my office last night for an hour.

MEMBER SILVERSTEIN: Say that again, please.

MR. ROBINSON: So, I'm asking that
you continue this at least until January 9th. I think that's the date I need to prepare -I asked for an earlier date, but, unfortunately, Mr. Rivero is not available, the subsequent date I was not available, and the 9th I have a matter, but my associate can handle that. I will be available for the 9th of January of 2013, if the Board decides to continue this.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: I think Mr. Silverstein next to you called about the associate the day before or something.

MR. ROBINSON: Last night, because I expected my trial to end earlier, on Monday, I'm sorry, Tuesday, they came back last night at 4:30.

I had planned a meeting with the Amharic interpreter and Ms. Asefu at 4:00 in my office. The interpreter is qualified in Amharic, and she said she could be there at 4:00.
I called my office and advised my
associate, Cheryl Torralba, that I could not make it, and I advised her. She has been involved with the case, that I couldn't make it, and what she should explain to the interpreter.

And so, when I got to the office last night at 5:45, Ms. Torralba told me that Mrs. Asefu had stated in response to the interpreter that she had first heard that her license would be revoked and she couldn't reapply for five years, for other matters.

So, it's very clear that I need to re-advise her from the very beginning, and with an interpreter.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Mr. Rivero, do you have a position on the request for continuance?

MR. RIVERO: We, actually, have no objection. I don't want to be in the way of his client understanding. And, I am available on the 9th.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Okay.

MR. RIVERO: My witness will be available as well.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: I understand that the Board has a space on the calendar January 9th at 1:30. So, I would now turn to Board Members to see if they have questions or concerns about continuing this hearing.

MEMBER SILVERSTEIN: Madam Chair?
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Yes.
MEMBER SILVERSTEIN: I think that it's important that we strike a balance here between fairness and, dare I say, special privilege. And, I'm trying to be respectful about this, but there's a pattern of violation here, it appears. This is not the first violation. And, if this were to happen to someone who didn't -- who did speak English, would they be held to a different standard than someone who uses the inability to speak English as a primary language as a shield?

And, I don't want to seem harsh, but I'm very troubled by that, and it is
difficult to strike a fairness. We have many people in our community who do not speak English, and we should not hold them to a higher or lower standard. It says equal justice under the law above the Supreme Court. It doesn't say in Greek, it doesn't say in Amharic, it doesn't say in Chinese, but it is for all of us.

And, as we deliberate on this, I just want to say that I'm very troubled by the idea that someone could be charged with violating the law, and would have a different standard of response and compliance, because of the inability to speak the language that is the lingua franca, the language of the law in the United States.

MR. ROBINSON: May I respond?
MEMBER SILVERSTEIN: Yes.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Yes.
MEMBER SILVERSTEIN: Yes, sir.
MR. ROBINSON: I fully understand
your position. However, not to argue
constitutional or anything like that, but I agree that there must be this even-handed approach among all parties that appear before administrative as well as judicial bodies.

However, the Due Process Clause always requires that before a final judgment is entered that would deprive a person of their property rights that they must have due notice and be fully aware of those conditions of which they can lose their property rights.

And, we've seen in the criminal courts, saw defendants coming in asking for a continuance at the last minute. They don't like their lawyer, they want to get another lawyer. The court is inconvenienced, the parties are inconvenienced, but our system does that.
And, what we want to do and say is
that whenever we enter a final judgment, and that final judgment deprives someone of property or a property right, that they cannot come back and say, I didn't get notice. We
need to make sure that none of the procedural problems would preclude that final judgment from being overturned.

I think it is my fault, Mr.
Silverstein, that I did not follow my first intuition, and that is, I believed my client, she tells me that she understands, and then, unfortunately, I find out, as I always do prep before hearings, that she didn't, and that's what has happened here.
And so, I ask that -- I apologize
for that, and I ask the Board to exercise discretion and allow us to come forth on the 9th. We certainly can't raise this argument to anyone else.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Mr. Alberti, did you want to say something here? MEMBER ALBERTI: Yes. I will
approve of the continuance. However, part of the responsibility here is not just your responsibility, Mr. Robinson, but your client's responsibility to be conscientious
about the matters of her business. And, conscientious about understanding and adhering to the laws that govern her business.

What I'm seeing today, and what I see from the past history, leaves me with the impression right now that your client isn't trying very hard, isn't very conscientious. And, that -- I will leave it at that.

MR. ROBINSON: I understand. CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Other comments?

Well, I'd like to make a couple, and one is, you know, whenever we have Show Cause Status hearings, and I believe your client wasn't here, and maybe because she didn't understand, but we always ask if they understand the notice, if they understand the violation, and what it's future is.

And so, I think that is very
important, and what I'm hearing you saying is
that, your client really didn't understand.
And, I'm in your favor, that's a
reason for a continuance, if a licensee really does not understand the procedures. And, therefore, would be prejudiced, and it might not be a fair hearing.

And, I think due process and fair hearings are very important, and in this case the Government has consented, or has no objection, and no prejudice to the other side in delay. Sometimes things happen, you know, so, in general, you know, we have a schedule and parties need to adhere to it, but sometimes things happen that I think can rise to the level of justifying a continuance. And, particularly, in this case, where we do have an opening, I don't believe that the Board is inconvenienced by this.

So, I would be in favor of granting the continuance in this case.

Are there any other comments before the motion?

Not hearing any, then I would move that we grant the continuance to January 9,

2013 at 1:30 p.m.
Do I have a second?
MEMBER BROOKS: Second.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Mr. Brooks has seconded the motion.

All those in favor say aye.
(Ayes.)
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: All those opposed?

MEMBER JONES: Opposed.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: All those abstaining.

MEMBER SILVERSTEIN: Abstain.
CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Then the vote
is $3: 1: 1$, and the motion passes to grant the continuance at 1:30 p.m.

Thank you.
MR. ROBINSON: Thank you, Madam Chair.

MEMBER SILVERSTEIN: Madam Chair, I'd like to point out, and I would like the

Licensee to know and to speak, that this

Agency is very concerned about the ability of people to communicate to us.

We do have, in fact, in this room, an Amharic speaker. If you have questions, if you have any issues, we comply fully with all Federal laws that require us, and all local laws, that require us to reach out to you so that you can understand those laws.

It is not that we want to be harsh. We want to be inclusive, but if we are taking 99 steps to you, you have to take that one step to us.

I hope you understand that, and we'll see you next month.

CHAIRPERSON MILLER: Have a happy holiday.

Okay. That concludes our morning calendar, and so the Board will recess now. (Whereupon, at 11:41 a.m., the Board recessed, and will return at 1:30 p.m., this same day.)

| A | 17:19 | 6:1,1,11 7:14 9:20 | 12:12 | follow 6:21 13:5 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ability } 4: 417: 1 \\ & \text { able } 6: 6 \end{aligned}$ | B | $14: 6,15,21$ s 13:22 | 11 | forth 13:13 <br> forward 7:8 |
| Abstain 16:13 | back $8: 1512: 22$ | closer 3:7 |  |  |
|  | balance 10:11 <br> beginning 9:13 | Columbia 1:1 2:9 | deprives 12:20 | ully 11:21 12 |
| abstaining 16:12 |  | 7 12:2 | 10:1 | 17:5 |
| accurately $4: 1$ adhere 15:11 | beginning 9:13 behalf 2:12 |  |  | ut |
| adhere 15:11 adhering 14:2 | believe 5:5 14:14 | comments 14:11 15:19 <br> communicate 17:2 |  | G |
| administrative | 1 |  |  | general 15:10 |
| advised 7:4,9 8:22 | best 4:4 <br> Beverage 1:2,12,12 |  | ns |  |
| $\begin{gathered} 9: 2 \\ \text { affirm 3:22 } \end{gathered}$ |  | community $11: 2$ <br> compliance 11:13 | District 1:1 2:8 | ,11,17, |
|  | Beverage 1:2,12,12 bewilderment 5:13 |  | NALD 1:17 | govern 14:3 |
| Agency 17:1 agree 12:2 | $\begin{array}{\|c} \text { Board 1:2,12 2:7 } \\ 8: 810: 4,613: 12 \\ 15: 16 ~ 17: 18,20 \end{array}$ | comply 17:5 <br> concerned 5:12 <br> $17 \cdot 1$ | due 12:5,8 15:5 | Government 15:7 |
|  |  |  |  | 15:22 16:15 |
| Alberti 1:17 4:20 $5: 1 \text { 13:16,18 }$ | bodies 12:4 | concerns 10:7 | E | granting 15: <br> Greek 11:6 |
| 5:1 13:16,18 <br> Alcoholic 1:2,12,12 | Brooks 1:17 16:3,4 |  |  |  |
|  | Building 1:13 | conditions 12:9 | easier 3:7 | H |
| Alemayehu 1:6 2:20,20 4:8 allow 13:13 | business 14:1,3 | conditions 12:9 conscientious 13:22 14:2,7 <br> consented 15:7 | English 3:14 4:3,3 | hand 3:20 <br> handle 8:7 <br> happen 10:16 15:9 |
|  | C |  |  |  |
| Amharic 3:14,15 | calendar 2:4 10:4 | consented 15:7 <br> consequences 7:10 | enter 12:19 | 15:12 |
| 6:18,20 11:7 |  | titutiona | entered 12 | happened 13:10 |
| 17:4 |  | continuan |  | py 17 : |
| ANC 1:9 2:6apologize 7:5,11 | 15:14,18 | 12:13 13:19 15:1 | even-handed 12 exercise 13:12 | hard 14:7 harsh 10:21 17:10 |
|  |  | 15:13,18,22 16:16 | expected $8: 14$ | hear 3:7 <br> heard 6:4 9:9 |
|  |  | continue 8:1,9 | explain 9:4 |  |
| appears 10:15 | certainly 13:14 <br> Chair 10:8 16:19 | continuing 10:7 | explained 6:2 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { hearing 1:6,13 4:14 } \\ & \text { 4:16 5:19 7:8 } \\ & \text { 10:7 14:20 15:4 } \\ & \text { 15:21 } \end{aligned}$ |
| 12:3 | 16:20 | conversations 7:13 | F |  |
|  |  | Counsel 7:4 <br> couple 14:12 | fact 17: |  |
|  | Chairperson 1:14 |  | fair 15:4,5 | hearings 13:9 |
| arranged 5:15 | 1:16 2:3,10,13,16 | course 6:5 | fairness 10:12 11:1 | 0: |
| Asefu 1:6 2:20 8:18 | 2:19,22 3:4,12,16 | courts 12:12 | faithfully 4:1 |  |
|  | 4:6,9,12,15,22 5:2 |  | fault 13:4 <br> favor 14:22 15:17 | HERMAN 1:18 |
| asked | 10:3,9 11:19 | criminal 12:11 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { favor } 14: 2215: 17 \\ & 16: 6 \end{aligned}$ | gher 11:4 |
| asking 7:11,22 | $\begin{aligned} & 13: 16 ~ 14: 10 ~ 16: 4 \\ & 16: 8,11,14 ~ 17: 15 \end{aligned}$ |  | Federal 17:6 <br> Fernando 1:21 2:8 | histo |
| 12:12 |  |  |  | hold 11:3 |
| ssociate 5:21 6:8 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 16:8,11,14 17:15 } \\ & \text { charged 11:11 } \end{aligned}$ | $\xrightarrow{\text { D }}$ |  | holiday $17: 1$ <br> hope 17:13 <br> hour 7:19 |
|  | Cheryl 9:1 |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { final 12:6,19,20 } \\ & 13: 2 \end{aligned}$ |  |
| 9:20 10:2 | Chinese 11:7 | date 8:2,3,5 <br> day 8:12 17:21 <br> December 1:10 <br> decides 8:8 | find 13:8 <br> first 6:3,21 9:9 <br> 10:15 13:5 <br> five 6:7 9:11 <br> fluent 6:19 |  |
| 6:5 12:9 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Clause 12:5 } \\ & \text { clear 6:9,15,16 7:3 } \\ & \text { 7:13 9:12 } \\ & \text { client 5:6,11,18,21 } \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |
| aye 16.6 |  |  |  | ea 11:11 |
| Ayes 16:7 |  |  |  | ill-prepared 7:9 |


| important 10:11 | lingua 11:15 | 9:12 13:115:11 | prior 5:15 | Rivero 1:21 2:7,8 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 14:20 15:6 | local 17:6 | NICK 1:17 | privilege 10:13 | 4:9,10 8:4 9:15,18 |
| impression 14:6 | located 2:5 | night 6:7 7:7,19 | probably 6:18,20 | 10:1 |
| inability 10:19 | look 5:13 | 8:13,15 9:7 | 7:7,8 | Robinson 1:22 2:11 |
| 11:14 | lose 6:6 12:10 | notice 12:9,22 | problems 13:2 | 2:12,15,15,16,17 |
| inclusive | lower 11:4 | 4:17 | procedural 4:10 | 2:18 4:13,18 5:3,4 |
| convenienced |  | NW | 13:1 | 7:2,22 8:13 11:17 |
| ,16 | M | N.W 1:13 | procedures 15:2 | 11:21 13:21 14:9 |
| indicated 5:11 6:3 | Madam 4:11 10:8 |  | proceedings 4: | 16:18 |
| intended 7:5 |  | 0 | process 12:5 15:5 | room 1:13 17:3 |
| interp | matter | objection 9:19 15:8 | property 12:8,10 | Ruthanne 1:13,16 |
| interpreter 3:19 | 8:6 | office 5:18,21 7:18 | 12:21,21 |  |
| 5:17,17,22 6:12 | matters 9:11 14:1 | 8:19,22 9:6 | P-R-O-C-E | S |
| 14,16 8:18,19 | meeting 1:3 5:16 | okay $2: 3,10,17,19$ | 2:1 | saw 12:12 |
| 9:5,9,14 | 7:78:17 | 3:5,12,17,19,21 | p.m 16:1,16 17:20 | saying 14:20 |
| introductions 4:21 | Member 1:17,17 | 4:6,12,16 5:1 9:22 |  | says 11:4 |
| intuition 6:21 13:6 | 1:18,18 4:20 5:1 | 7:17 | Q | hedule 15:10 |
| involved 9:3 | 7:20 10:8,10 | op | qualified 8:19 | seat 3:6 |
| issues 17:5 | 11:18,20 13:18 | op | questions 10:6 17:4 | second 16:2, |
| J |  |  | R |  |
| nuar | me |  | raise 3:20 13 | :4 |
| 15:22 | microphone 3:8 | P | 7:7 | en 12:11 |
| JONES 1:18 16:10 | MIKE 1:18 | part 6:21 13 | really 6:12 14:21 | shield 10:20 |
| judgment 12:6,19 | Miller 1:14,16 | particularly 15: | 15:1 | Show 1:6 4:16 |
| 12:20 13:2 | 2:10,13,16,19,22 | parties 12:3,16 | reapply | 14:13 |
| judicial 12:4 | 3:4,12,16 4:6,9,12 | 15:11 | reason 4:18 15:1 | side 15:8 |
| justice 11:5 | 4:15,22 5:2 7:1 | pa | re | Silverstein 1:18 |
| justifying 15:13 | 8:10 9:15,22 10:3 | pattern 10:14 | recessed 17:20 | 7:20 8:11 10:8,10 |
|  | 10:9 11:19 13:16 | people 11:2 17: | Reeves 1:13 | 11:18,20 13:5 |
| K | 6:4,8,11 | perfectly 6:14 | request 4:14 9:1 | 16:13,20 |
| know 7:18 14:13 | :14 17:15 |  | requesting 4:16 | sir 11:20 |
| 15:9,10 16:22 | mi | pl | require 17: |  |
| L | m | $\mathbf{p l}$ | respectful 10: | sorry 2:13 3:1 8:15 |
| language 3:13 | mi |  | respond 11:17 | speak 10:17,19 |
| 10:20 11:14,15 | M | position 9:16 11:22 | response 9:8 11:13 | 11:2,14 16:22 |
| late 7:6 | month 17:14 |  | responsibility |  |
| lateness 7:12 | morning $2: 4,7$, |  | 13:20,21,22 | speaking 5:11 |
| law 11:5,12,15 | 2:17,18 7:17 | prejudiced 15:3 | Retailer 1:8 | special 10:12 |
| laws 14:3 17:6,7,8 | 17:17 | prep 5:18 13:8 | retained 5:22 7:16 | spoke 5:6 |
| lawyer 12:14,15 | motion 15:20 16:5 | prepare 8:2 | return 17:20 | standard 10:18 |
| leave $14: 8$ | 16: | PRESENT 1:15,20 | re | 11:4,13 |
| leaves 14:5 | move 15:21 | presiding 1:14 | re-advise 9:13 | stat |
| level 15:13 |  | pretty 6:9,14,16 | right 3:20 7:1 | States 11:16 |
| license 1:8 2:6 6:6 | N |  | 12.21 14:6 | tatus 14:14 |
| 10 | name 2:14 3:9 | previously 6:2 | rights 12:8,10 | step 17:12 |
| licensee 15:1 16:22 | need 3:18 6:12 8:2 | primary 10:20 | rise $15: 12$ | step 17.12 |



Neal R. Gross \& Co., Inc.
202-234-4433

